Introduction
Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods

## Solution of the Gravitational Wave Tensor Equation Using Spectral Methods

Vector Evolution

Jérôme Novak

Jerome.Novak@obspm.fr

Laboratoire de l'Univers et de ses Théories (LUTH) CNRS / Observatoire de Paris

From Geometry to Numerics, November $21^{\text {st }} 2006$

## Introduction

Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary
(1) Introduction

- Maximally-constrained evolution scheme
- Evolution Equation
- Numerical Methods
(1) InTRODUCTION
- Maximally-constrained evolution scheme
- Evolution Equation
- Numerical Methods
(2) Divergence-free evolution of A Vector
- Pure-spin vector spherical harmonics
- Differential operators in terms of new potentials
- New system for time evolution
(1) Introduction
- Maximally-constrained evolution scheme
- Evolution Equation
- Numerical Methods
(2) Divergence-free evolution of A Vector
- Pure-spin vector spherical harmonics
- Differential operators in terms of new potentials
- New system for time evolution
(3) DIVERGENCE-FREE EVOLUTION OF A SYMMETRIC TENSOR
- Method
- Results

Flat metric and Dirac gauge<br>Following Bonazzola et al. (2004)

## Tensor Wave

 EquationJérôme Novak

Introduction
Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary
Conformal 3+1 (a.k.a BSSN) formulation

Flat metric and Dirac gauge<br>Following Bonazzola et al. (2004)

Tensor Wave Equation

## Introduction

Constrained evolution Evolution Equation Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

Conformal $3+1$ (a.k.a BSSN) formulation, but use of $f_{i j}$ (with $\frac{\partial f_{i j}}{\partial t}=0$ ) as the asymptotic structure of $\gamma_{i j}$, and $\mathcal{D}_{i}$ the associated covariant derivative.

## Flat metric and Dirac gauge <br> Following Bonazzola et al. (2004)

Tensor Wave
Equation
Jérôme Novak

Introduction
Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

Conformal $3+1$ (a.k.a BSSN) formulation, but use of $f_{i j}$ (with $\frac{\partial f_{i j}}{\partial t}=0$ ) as the asymptotic structure of $\gamma_{i j}$, and $\mathcal{D}_{i}$ the associated covariant derivative.

## Conformal factor $\psi$

$$
\tilde{\gamma}_{i j}:=\Psi^{-4} \gamma_{i j} \text { with } \psi:=\left(\frac{\gamma}{f}\right)^{1 / 12}, \text { so } \operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}_{i j}=f
$$

Finally,

$$
\tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=f^{i j}+h^{i j}
$$

is the deviation of the 3 -metric from conformal flatness.

Conformal $3+1$ (a.k.a BSSN) formulation, but use of $f_{i j}$ (with $\frac{\partial f_{i j}}{\partial t}=0$ ) as the asymptotic structure of $\gamma_{i j}$, and $\mathcal{D}_{i}$ the associated covariant derivative.

## CONFORMAL FACTOR $\Psi$

$$
\tilde{\gamma}_{i j}:=\Psi^{-4} \gamma_{i j} \text { with } \psi:=\left(\frac{\gamma}{f}\right)^{1 / 12}, \text { so } \operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}_{i j}=f
$$

Finally,

$$
\tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=f^{i j}+h^{i j}
$$

is the deviation of the 3 -metric from conformal flatness.
Generalization the gauge introduced by Dirac (1959) to any type of coordinates:

DIVERGENCE-FREE CONDITION ON $\tilde{\gamma}^{i j}$

$$
\mathcal{D}_{j} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=\mathcal{D}_{j} h^{i j}=0
$$

+ Maximal slicing $(K=0)$


## Einstein equations <br> Dirac gauge and maximal SLicing

Tensor Wave
Equation

Jérôme Novak

Introduction
Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

## Constraint Equations

$$
\begin{aligned}
\Delta \Psi & =\mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{Ham}} \\
\Delta \beta^{i}+\frac{1}{3} \mathcal{D}^{i}\left(\mathcal{D}_{j} \beta^{j}\right) & =\mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{Mom}}
\end{aligned}
$$

## Einstein EQuATIONS

Dirac gauge and maximal SLicing

Tensor Wave Equation

Introduction

## Constrained

 evolution
## Evolution

Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

## Constraint Equations

$$
\begin{aligned}
\Delta \Psi & =\mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{Ham}} \\
\Delta \beta^{i}+\frac{1}{3} \mathcal{D}^{i}\left(\mathcal{D}_{j} \beta^{j}\right) & =\mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{Mom}}
\end{aligned}
$$

## TRACE OF DYNAMICAL EQUATIONS

$$
\Delta N=\mathcal{S}_{\dot{K}}
$$

## DYNAMICAL EQUATIONS

$$
\frac{\partial^{2} h^{i j}}{\partial t^{2}}-\frac{N^{2}}{\Psi^{4}} \Delta h^{i j}-2 £_{\boldsymbol{\beta}} \frac{\partial h^{i j}}{\partial t}+£_{\boldsymbol{\beta}} £_{\boldsymbol{\beta}} h^{i j}=\mathcal{S}_{\mathrm{Dyn}}^{i j}
$$

Tensor Wave Equation

Jérôme Novak

## Introduction

Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components

Tensor Wave Equation

Jérôme Novak

## Introduction

Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions

Tensor Wave Equation

Jérôme Novak

## Introduction

Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions - $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$

Evolution Equation<br>POSITION OF THE PROBLEM

Tensor Wave Equation

Jérôme Novak

## Introduction

Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions - $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ $\Rightarrow 2$ degrees of freedom


## Evolution Equation <br> POSITION OF THE PROBLEM

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions - $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ $\Rightarrow 2$ degrees of freedom
- Work with $h=f_{i j} h^{i j}$ which has a given value: the condition (det $\tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1$ ) - non-linear condition is imposed with an iteration on $h$;


## Evolution Equation

## POSITION OF THE PROBLEM

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions - $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ $\Rightarrow 2$ degrees of freedom
- Work with $h=f_{i j} h^{i j}$ which has a given value: the condition $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ - non-linear condition is imposed with an iteration on $h$;
- the evolution operator appearing is not, in general, hyperbolic (complex eigenvalues); with the Dirac gauge, it is (result by I. Cordero).

Simplified numerical problem:

## Evolution Equation

## POSITION OF THE PROBLEM

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions - $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ $\Rightarrow 2$ degrees of freedom
- Work with $h=f_{i j} h^{i j}$ which has a given value: the condition (det $\tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1$ )- non-linear condition is imposed with an iteration on $h$;
- the evolution operator appearing is not, in general, hyperbolic (complex eigenvalues); with the Dirac gauge, it is (result by I. Cordero).

Simplified numerical problem:

- solve a flat wave equation for a symmetric tensor $\square h^{i j}=\mathcal{S}^{i j}$,


## Evolution Equation <br> POSITION OF THE PROBLEM

- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions - $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ $\Rightarrow 2$ degrees of freedom
- Work with $h=f_{i j} h^{i j}$ which has a given value: the condition $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ - non-linear condition is imposed with an iteration on $h$;
- the evolution operator appearing is not, in general, hyperbolic (complex eigenvalues); with the Dirac gauge, it is (result by I. Cordero).

Simplified numerical problem:

- solve a flat wave equation for a symmetric tensor $\square h^{i j}=\mathcal{S}^{i j}$,
- ensure the gauge condition $\mathcal{D}_{j} h^{i j}=0$,
- Wave-like equation for a symmetric tensor: 6 components - 3 Dirac gauge conditions - $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ $\Rightarrow 2$ degrees of freedom
- Work with $h=f_{i j} h^{i j}$ which has a given value: the condition $\left(\operatorname{det} \tilde{\gamma}^{i j}=1\right)$ - non-linear condition is imposed with an iteration on $h$;
- the evolution operator appearing is not, in general, hyperbolic (complex eigenvalues); with the Dirac gauge, it is (result by I. Cordero).

Simplified numerical problem:

- solve a flat wave equation for a symmetric tensor $\square h^{i j}=\mathcal{S}^{i j}$,
- ensure the gauge condition $\mathcal{D}_{j} h^{i j}=0$,
- has a given value of the trace.

NUMERICAL LIBRARY LORENE http://www.lorene.obspm.fr

Tensor Wave
Equation

## Introduction

Constrained evolution Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDES
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

Use of spherical coordinates:

- The radial part of a scalar field $\phi$ is decomposed on a set of orthonormal polynomials (here Chebyshev);


## Solutions of Poisson and wave equations

NUMERICAL LIBRARY LORENE http://www.lorene.obspm.fr

Tensor Wave Equation

Use of spherical coordinates:

- The radial part of a scalar field $\phi$ is decomposed on a set of orthonormal polynomials (here Chebyshev);
- The angular part is decomposed on a set of spherical harmonics $Y_{\ell}^{m}(\theta, \varphi)$, which are eigenvectors of the angular part of the Laplace operator

$$
\Delta_{\theta \varphi} Y_{\ell}^{m}=-\ell(\ell+1) Y_{\ell}^{m}
$$

$$
\left(\frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r^{2}}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial}{\partial r}-\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^{2}}\right) \phi_{\ell m}(r)=\sigma_{\ell m}(r)
$$

Accuracy on the solution $\sim 10^{-13}$ (exponential decay)

## Solutions of Poisson and wave equations

Tensor Wave Equation

Use of spherical coordinates:

- The radial part of a scalar field $\phi$ is decomposed on a set of orthonormal polynomials (here Chebyshev);
- The angular part is decomposed on a set of spherical harmonics $Y_{\ell}^{m}(\theta, \varphi)$, which are eigenvectors of the angular part of the Laplace operator

$$
\Delta_{\theta \varphi} Y_{\ell}^{m}=-\ell(\ell+1) Y_{\ell}^{m}
$$

$$
\begin{array}{cc}
\Delta \phi=\sigma & \square \phi=\sigma \\
\left(\frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r^{2}}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial}{\partial r}-\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^{2}}\right) \phi_{\ell m}(r)=\sigma_{\ell m}(r) & {\left[1-\frac{\delta t^{2}}{2}\left(\frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r^{2}}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial}{\partial r}-\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^{2}}\right)\right] \phi_{\ell m}^{J+1}=\sigma_{\ell m}^{J}}
\end{array}
$$

Accuracy on the solution $\sim 10^{-13}$ (exponential decay)

Accuracy on the solution $\sim 10^{-10}$ (time-differencing)

## Solutions of Poisson and wave equations

Tensor Wave Equation

Use of spherical coordinates:

- The radial part of a scalar field $\phi$ is decomposed on a set of orthonormal polynomials (here Chebyshev);
- The angular part is decomposed on a set of spherical harmonics $Y_{\ell}^{m}(\theta, \varphi)$, which are eigenvectors of the angular part of the Laplace operator

$$
\Delta_{\theta \varphi} Y_{\ell}^{m}=-\ell(\ell+1) Y_{\ell}^{m}
$$

$$
\left(\frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r^{2}}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial}{\partial r}-\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^{2}}\right) \phi_{\ell m}(r)=\sigma_{\ell m}(r)
$$

$$
\left[1-\frac{\delta t^{2}}{2}\left(\frac{\partial^{2}}{\partial r^{2}}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial}{\partial r}-\frac{\ell(\ell+1)}{r^{2}}\right)\right] \phi_{\ell m}^{J+1}=\sigma_{\ell m}^{J}
$$

Accuracy on the solution $\sim 10^{-13}$ (exponential decay)

Accuracy on the solution $\sim 10^{-10}$ (time-differencing)
$\square \phi=\sigma$
$\forall(\ell, m)$ the operator inversion $\Longleftrightarrow$ inversion of a $\sim 30 \times 30$ matrix Non-linear parts are evaluated in the physical space and contribute as sources to the equations.

## VECTOR SPHERICAL HARMONICS

Following e.g. Thorne (1980)

Tensor Wave Equation

## Introduction

Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

A 3D vector field $V$ can be decomposed onto a set of vector spherical harmonics

$$
\boldsymbol{V}=\sum_{\ell, m} R_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R}(\theta, \varphi)+E_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E}(\theta, \varphi)+B_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B}(\theta, \varphi)
$$

- pure spin vector harmonics,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R} \propto Y_{\ell m} \boldsymbol{r}, \text { (longitudinal) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E} \propto \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m}, \text { (transverse) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B} \propto \boldsymbol{r} \times \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m} \text { (transverse) }
\end{aligned}
$$

## VECTOR SPHERICAL HARMONICS

Following e.g. Thorne (1980)

Tensor Wave
Equation

Introduction
Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical Harmonics PDES
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

A 3D vector field $V$ can be decomposed onto a set of vector spherical harmonics

$$
\boldsymbol{V}=\sum_{\ell, m} R_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R}(\theta, \varphi)+E_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E}(\theta, \varphi)+B_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B}(\theta, \varphi),
$$

- pure spin vector harmonics,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R} \propto Y_{\ell m} \boldsymbol{r}, \text { (longitudinal) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E} \propto \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m}, \text { (transverse) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B} \propto \boldsymbol{r} \times \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m} \text { (transverse) }
\end{aligned}
$$

- orthonormal set of regular angular functions,


## VECTOR SPHERICAL HARMONICS

Following e.g. Thorne (1980)

Tensor Wave Equation

A 3D vector field $V$ can be decomposed onto a set of vector spherical harmonics

$$
\boldsymbol{V}=\sum_{\ell, m} R_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R}(\theta, \varphi)+E_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E}(\theta, \varphi)+B_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B}(\theta, \varphi),
$$

- pure spin vector harmonics,
- orthonormal set of regular angular functions,
- not eigenfunctions of vector

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R} \propto Y_{\ell m} \boldsymbol{r}, \text { (longitudinal) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E} \propto \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m}, \text { (transverse) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B} \propto \boldsymbol{r} \times \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m} \text { (transverse) }
\end{aligned}
$$ angular Laplacian

## VECTOR SPHERICAL HARMONICS

Tensor Wave
Equation

A 3D vector field $V$ can be decomposed onto a set of vector spherical harmonics

$$
\boldsymbol{V}=\sum_{\ell, m} R_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R}(\theta, \varphi)+E_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E}(\theta, \varphi)+B_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B}(\theta, \varphi),
$$

- pure spin vector harmonics, $\quad \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R} \propto Y_{\ell m} \boldsymbol{r}$, (longitudinal)
- orthonormal set of regular angular functions,

$$
\boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E} \propto \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m}, \text { (transverse) }
$$

- not eigenfunctions of vector

$$
\boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B} \propto \boldsymbol{r} \times \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m} \text { (transverse) }
$$ angular Laplacian

$V^{r}=\sum R_{\ell m}(r) Y_{\ell m}(\theta, \varphi)$, and we define two other potentials

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \eta(r, \theta, \varphi)=\sum_{\ell, m} E_{\ell m}(r) Y_{\ell m} \\
& \mu(r, \theta, \varphi)=\sum_{\ell, m} B_{\ell m}(r) Y_{\ell m}
\end{aligned}
$$

## VECTOR SPHERICAL HARMONICS

Tensor Wave Equation

A 3D vector field $V$ can be decomposed onto a set of vector spherical harmonics

$$
\boldsymbol{V}=\sum_{\ell, m} R_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R}(\theta, \varphi)+E_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E}(\theta, \varphi)+B_{\ell m}(r) \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B}(\theta, \varphi)
$$

- pure spin vector harmonics,

$$
\begin{aligned}
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{R} \propto Y_{\ell m} \boldsymbol{r}, \text { (longitudinal) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{E} \propto \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m}, \text { (transverse) } \\
& \boldsymbol{Y}_{\ell m}^{B} \propto \boldsymbol{r} \times \mathcal{D} Y_{\ell m} \text { (transverse) }
\end{aligned}
$$

- orthonormal set of regular angular functions,
- not eigenfunctions of vector angular Laplacian

$$
V^{r}=\sum R_{\ell m}(r) Y_{\ell m}(\theta, \varphi) \text {, and we define two other potentials }
$$

$$
\begin{aligned}
V^{\theta} & =\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial \theta}-\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial \mu}{\partial \varphi}, & \eta(r, \theta, \varphi) & =\sum_{\ell, m} E_{\ell m}(r) Y_{\ell m} \\
V^{\varphi} & =\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial \eta}{\partial \varphi}+\frac{\partial \mu}{\partial \theta} ; & \mu(r, \theta, \varphi) & =\sum_{\ell, m} B_{\ell m}(r) Y_{\ell m}
\end{aligned}
$$

DIFFERENTIAL OPERATORS IN TERMS OF NEW POTENTIALS

Tensor Wave Equation

## Introduction

Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical Harmonics PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

Flat wave operator $\square V^{i}=S^{i}$ (DIVERGENCE-FREE CASE)

$$
\begin{aligned}
-\frac{\partial^{2} V^{r}}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta V^{r}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 V^{r}}{r^{2}} & =S^{r} \\
-\frac{\partial^{2} \eta}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta \eta+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r} & =\eta_{S} \\
-\frac{\partial^{2} \mu}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta \mu & =\mu_{S}
\end{aligned}
$$ POTENTIALS

Tensor Wave Equation

Introduction
Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical Harmonics PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution Method Results Summary

Flat wave operator $\square V^{i}=S^{i}$ (DIVERGENCE-FREE CASE)

$$
\begin{aligned}
-\frac{\partial^{2} V^{r}}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta V^{r}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 V^{r}}{r^{2}} & =S^{r} \\
-\frac{\partial^{2} \eta}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta \eta+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r} & =\eta_{S} \\
-\frac{\partial^{2} \mu}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta \mu & =\mu_{S}
\end{aligned}
$$

## DIVERGENCE-FREE CONDITION $\mathcal{D}_{i} V^{i}=0$

$$
\frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 V^{r}}{r}+\frac{1}{r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta=0
$$

Introduction
Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical Harmonics PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution Method Results Summary

DIFFERENTIAL OPERATORS IN TERMS OF NEW POTENTIALS

Flat wave operator $\square V^{i}=S^{i}$ (DIVERGENCE-FREE CASE)

$$
\begin{aligned}
-\frac{\partial^{2} V^{r}}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta V^{r}+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 V^{r}}{r^{2}} & =S^{r} \\
-\frac{\partial^{2} \eta}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta \eta+\frac{2}{r} \frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r} & =\eta_{S} \\
-\frac{\partial^{2} \mu}{\partial t^{2}}+\Delta \mu & =\mu_{S}
\end{aligned}
$$

DIVERGENCE-FREE CONDITION $\mathcal{D}_{i} V^{i}=0$

$$
\frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 V^{r}}{r}+\frac{1}{r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta=0
$$

... thus $\mu$ does not depend on the divergence of $V$.

## Helmholtz Decomposition

Any vector field $V$ on $\mathbb{R}^{3}$, twice continuously differentiable and with rapid enough decay at infinity can be uniquely written as

$$
\boldsymbol{V}=\tilde{\boldsymbol{V}}+\mathcal{D} \phi, \text { with } \mathcal{D}_{i} \tilde{V}^{i}=0
$$

Any vector field $V$ on $\mathbb{R}^{3}$, twice continuously differentiable and with rapid enough decay at infinity can be uniquely written as

$$
\begin{gathered}
\qquad \begin{aligned}
\boldsymbol{V} & =\tilde{\boldsymbol{V}}+\mathcal{D} \phi, \text { with } \mathcal{D}_{i} \tilde{V}^{i}=0 \\
\text { from } \mathcal{D} \times \boldsymbol{V}=\mathcal{D} \times \tilde{\boldsymbol{V}} & \text {, one gets } \\
\mu_{V} & =\mu_{\tilde{V}} \text { (twice: } r \text { - and } \eta \text { - components) } \\
\frac{\partial \eta_{V}}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta_{V}}{r}-\frac{V^{r}}{r} & =\frac{\partial \eta_{\tilde{V}}}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta_{\tilde{V}}}{r}-\frac{\tilde{V}^{r}}{r}(\mu \text { - component) }
\end{aligned}
\end{gathered}
$$

Any vector field $V$ on $\mathbb{R}^{3}$, twice continuously differentiable and with rapid enough decay at infinity can be uniquely written as

$$
\boldsymbol{V}=\tilde{\boldsymbol{V}}+\mathcal{D} \phi, \text { with } \mathcal{D}_{i} \tilde{V}^{i}=0
$$

from $\mathcal{D} \times V=\mathcal{D} \times \tilde{\boldsymbol{V}}$, one gets

$$
\begin{aligned}
\mu_{V} & =\mu_{\tilde{V}} \text { (twice: } r \text { - and } \eta \text { - components), } \\
\frac{\partial \eta_{V}}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta_{V}}{r}-\frac{V^{r}}{r} & =\frac{\partial \eta_{\tilde{\tilde{}}}}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta_{\tilde{V}}}{r}-\frac{\tilde{V}^{r}}{r}(\mu \text { - component) } .
\end{aligned}
$$

$\Rightarrow$ the quantities

$$
A=\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta}{r}-\frac{V^{r}}{r}
$$

and $\mu$ are not sensitive to the gradient part of a vector.

## Evolution EQuAtions

ENSURING DIVERGENCE-FREE CONDITION...

Tensor Wave
Equation

## Introduction

Constrained evolution Evolution Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution

From the definition of $A$ and the expression of the wave operator for a vector, one gets for the source ( $\square V^{i}=S^{i}$ )

$$
A_{S}=\frac{\partial \eta_{S}}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta_{S}}{r}-\frac{S^{r}}{r}
$$

From the definition of $A$ and the expression of the wave operator for a vector, one gets for the source ( $\square V^{i}=S^{i}$ )

$$
A_{S}=\frac{\partial \eta_{S}}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta_{S}}{r}-\frac{S^{r}}{r},
$$

and

$$
\square A(V)=A_{S}
$$

once $A$ is known, one can reconstruct the vector $V^{i}$ from

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta}{r}-\frac{V^{r}}{r} & =A_{V} \\
\frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 V^{r}}{r}+\frac{1}{r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta & =0 \text { divergence-free condition. }
\end{aligned}
$$

From the definition of $A$ and the expression of the wave operator for a vector, one gets for the source ( $\square V^{i}=S^{i}$ )

$$
A_{S}=\frac{\partial \eta_{S}}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta_{S}}{r}-\frac{S^{r}}{r},
$$

and

$$
\square A(V)=A_{S}
$$

once $A$ is known, one can reconstruct the vector $V^{i}$ from

$$
\begin{aligned}
\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial r}+\frac{\eta}{r}-\frac{V^{r}}{r} & =A_{V} \\
\frac{\partial V^{r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 V^{r}}{r}+\frac{1}{r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta & =0 \text { divergence-free condition. }
\end{aligned}
$$

and $\mu$ (since $\left.\square \mu=\mu_{S}\right)$.

## InTEGRATION PROCEDURE

Tensor Wave Equation

Jérôme Novak

Introduction
Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary
(1) from $S^{i}$ compute $A_{S}$ and $\mu_{S}$,
(1) from $S^{i}$ compute $A_{S}$ and $\mu_{S}$,
(2) solve the equation for $\mu$,

## INTEGRATION PROCEDURE

## Introduction

Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
(1) from $S^{i}$ compute $A_{S}$ and $\mu_{S}$,
(2) solve the equation for $\mu$,
(3) solve the equation for $A$,

## INTEGRATION PROCEDURE

(1) from $S^{i}$ compute $A_{S}$ and $\mu_{S}$,
(2) solve the equation for $\mu$,

- solve the equation for $A$,
(1) solve the coupled system given by the divergence-free condition and the definition of $A$ to get $V^{r}$ and $\eta$,


## INTEGRATION PROCEDURE

(c) from $S^{i}$ compute $A_{S}$ and $\mu_{S}$,
(2) solve the equation for $\mu$,
(3) solve the equation for $A$,
(1) solve the coupled system given by the divergence-free condition and the definition of $A$ to get $V^{r}$ and $\eta$,
(0) reconstruct $V^{i}$ from $V^{r}, \eta$ and $\mu$.

## TENSOR SPHERICAL HARMONICS

Tensor Wave Equation

## Introduction

Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution

Method
Results
Summary

A 3D symmetric tensor field $h$ can be decomposed onto a set of tensor pure spin spherical harmonics and one can get 6 scalar potentials to represent the tensor:

| $\boldsymbol{T}^{L_{0}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{T_{0}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{E_{1}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{B_{1}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{E_{2}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{B_{2}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $h^{r r}$ | $\tau=h^{\theta \theta}+h^{\varphi \varphi}$ | $\eta$ | $\mu$ | $W$ | $X$ |

Tensor Wave Equation

A 3D symmetric tensor field $h$ can be decomposed onto a set of tensor pure spin spherical harmonics and one can get 6 scalar potentials to represent the tensor:

| $\boldsymbol{T}^{L_{0}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{T_{0}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{E_{1}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{B_{1}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{E_{2}}$ | $\boldsymbol{T}^{B_{2}}$ |
| :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: | :---: |
| $h^{r r}$ | $\tau=h^{\theta \theta}+h^{\varphi \varphi}$ | $\eta$ | $\mu$ | $W$ | $X$ |

with the following relations:

$$
\begin{aligned}
h^{r \theta} & =\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial \theta}-\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial \mu}{\partial \varphi} \\
h^{r \varphi} & =\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial \eta}{\partial \varphi}+\frac{\partial \mu}{\partial \theta} \\
\frac{h^{\theta \theta}-h^{\varphi \varphi}}{2} & =\frac{\partial^{2} W}{\partial \theta^{2}}-\frac{1}{\tan \theta} \frac{\partial W}{\partial \theta}-\frac{1}{\sin ^{2} \theta} \frac{\partial^{2} W}{\partial \varphi^{2}}-2 \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta}\left(\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial X}{\partial \varphi}\right) \\
h^{\theta \varphi} & =\frac{\partial^{2} X}{\partial \theta^{2}}-\frac{1}{\tan \theta} \frac{\partial X}{\partial \theta}-\frac{1}{\sin ^{2} \theta} \frac{\partial^{2} X}{\partial \varphi^{2}}+2 \frac{\partial}{\partial \theta}\left(\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial W}{\partial \varphi}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

## Divergence-free condition $H^{i}=\mathcal{D}_{j} h^{i j}=0$

## Introduction

Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results

$$
\begin{aligned}
H^{r} & =\frac{\partial h^{r r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 h^{r r}}{r}+\frac{1}{r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta-\frac{\tau}{r}=0 \\
H^{\eta} & =\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial r}+\frac{3 \eta}{r}+\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) \frac{W}{r}+\frac{\tau}{2 r}=0 \\
H^{\mu} & =\frac{\partial \mu}{\partial r}+\frac{3 \mu}{r}+\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) X=0
\end{aligned}
$$

## Divergence-free condition $H^{i}=\mathcal{D}_{j} h^{i j}=0$

## Introduction

Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method Results

$$
\begin{aligned}
H^{r} & =\frac{\partial h^{r r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 h^{r r}}{r}+\frac{1}{r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta-\frac{\tau}{r}=0 \\
H^{\eta} & =\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial r}+\frac{3 \eta}{r}+\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) \frac{W}{r}+\frac{\tau}{2 r}=0, \\
H^{\mu} & =\frac{\partial \mu}{\partial r}+\frac{3 \mu}{r}+\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) X=0
\end{aligned}
$$

## "ELECTRIC TYPE" POTENTIALS

$$
h^{r r}, \tau, \eta, W
$$

## DIVERGENCE-FREE CONDITION $H^{i}=\mathcal{D}_{j} h^{i j}=0$

$$
\begin{aligned}
H^{r} & =\frac{\partial h^{r r}}{\partial r}+\frac{2 h^{r r}}{r}+\frac{1}{r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta-\frac{\tau}{r}=0 \\
H^{\eta} & =\frac{\partial \eta}{\partial r}+\frac{3 \eta}{r}+\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) \frac{W}{r}+\frac{\tau}{2 r}=0, \\
H^{\mu} & =\frac{\partial \mu}{\partial r}+\frac{3 \mu}{r}+\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) X=0
\end{aligned}
$$

> "MAGNETIC TYPE"
> $\mu, X$
$\Rightarrow$ two groups of coupled equations for the wave operator.

DIVERGENCE-FREE PART OF A SYMMETRIC TENSOR

As for the Helmholtz decomposition:

$$
h^{i j}=\tilde{h}^{i j}+\mathcal{D}^{i} V^{j}+\mathcal{D}^{j} V^{i}
$$

Introduction
Constrained evolution Evolution Equation Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution

Method
Results
Summary TENSOR

As for the Helmholtz decomposition:

$$
h^{i j}=\tilde{h}^{i j}+\mathcal{D}^{i} V^{j}+\mathcal{D}^{j} V^{i}
$$

... but no possibility to use the curl operator on a symmetric tensor!

## DIVERGENCE-FREE PART OF A SYMMETRIC TENSOR

## Introduction

Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
As for the Helmholtz decomposition:

$$
h^{i j}=\tilde{h}^{i j}+\mathcal{D}^{i} V^{j}+\mathcal{D}^{j} V^{i}
$$

... but no possibility to use the curl operator on a symmetric tensor!
3 DEGREES OF FREEDOM FOR $\tilde{h}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
A & =\frac{\partial X}{\partial r}-\frac{\mu}{r} \\
B & =\frac{\partial W}{\partial r}-\frac{1}{2 r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} W-\frac{\eta}{r}+\frac{\tau}{4 r}, \\
C & =\frac{\partial \tau}{\partial r}-\frac{2 h^{r r}}{r}-2 \Delta_{\theta \varphi}\left(\frac{\partial W}{\partial r}+\frac{W}{r}\right)
\end{aligned}
$$

Introduction
Constrained evolution Evolution Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical Harmonics PDEs
Time Evolution Tensor Evolution Method Results Summary

## DIVERGENCE-FREE PART OF A SYMMETRIC TENSOR

As for the Helmholtz decomposition:

$$
h^{i j}=\tilde{h}^{i j}+\mathcal{D}^{i} V^{j}+\mathcal{D}^{j} V^{i}
$$

... but no possibility to use the curl operator on a symmetric tensor!

$$
\begin{array}{rlr}
3 \text { DEGREES OF FREEDOM FOR } \tilde{h} & \text { WAVE EQUATION } \\
A=\frac{\partial X}{\partial r}-\frac{\mu}{r}, & \square h^{i j}=S^{i j} \\
A=\frac{\partial W}{\partial r}-\frac{1}{2 r} \Delta_{\theta \varphi} W-\frac{\eta}{r}+\frac{\tau}{4 r}, & \square B+\frac{C}{2 r} \\
C=\frac{\partial \tau}{\partial r}-\frac{2 h^{r r}}{r}-2 \Delta_{\theta \varphi}\left(\frac{\partial W}{\partial r}+\frac{W}{r}\right) & \square C-\frac{2 C}{r^{2}}-\frac{8 \Delta_{\theta \varphi}}{r^{2}}
\end{array}
$$

## DIVERGENCE-FREE EVOLUTION

Tensor Wave
Equation
Jérôme Novak

Introduction
Constrained
evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical
Methods
Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Tensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary

DEFINE $\ell$ BY $\ell$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\tilde{B}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}+\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2(\ell+1)}, \\
\tilde{C}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}-\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2 \ell} ;
\end{aligned}
$$

## DIVERGENCE-FREE EVOLUTION

Tensor Wave Equation

## Define $\ell$ by $\ell$ <br> WAVE EQUATION $\square h^{i j}=S^{i j}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\tilde{B}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}+\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2(\ell+1)} \\
\tilde{C}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}-\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2 \ell}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\square \tilde{B}+\frac{2 \ell \tilde{B}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{B}_{S}, \\
\square \tilde{C}-\frac{2(\ell+1) \tilde{C}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{C}_{S} .
\end{array}
$$

In the case where $f_{i j} h^{i j}=h$ is given $\left(h^{r r}=h-\tau\right)$ :
(c) compute $A_{S}$ and $\tilde{B}_{S}$,

In the case where $f_{i j} h^{i j}=h$ is given $\left(h^{r r}=h-\tau\right)$ :
(1) compute $A_{S}$ and $\tilde{B}_{S}$,
(2) solve wave equations for $A$ and $\tilde{B}$ (a wave operator shifted in $\ell$ ),

## WAVE EQUATION $\square h^{i j}=S^{i j}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\tilde{B}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}+\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2(\ell+1)} \\
\tilde{C}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}-\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2 \ell}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\square \tilde{B}+\frac{2 \ell \tilde{B}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{B}_{S}, \\
\square \tilde{C}-\frac{2(\ell+1) \tilde{C}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{C}_{S} .
\end{array}
$$

In the case where $f_{i j} h^{i j}=h$ is given $\left(h^{r r}=h-\tau\right)$ :
(1) compute $A_{S}$ and $\tilde{B}_{S}$,
(2) solve wave equations for $A$ and $\tilde{B}$ (a wave operator shifted in $\ell$ ),

- solve the system composed of
- definition of $A$
- $H^{\mu}=0$ (Dirac gauge)
on the one hand, and


## WAVE EQUATION $\square h^{i j}=S^{i j}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\tilde{B}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}+\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2(\ell+1)} \\
\tilde{C}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}-\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2 \ell}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\square \tilde{B}+\frac{2 \ell \tilde{B}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{B}_{S}, \\
\square \tilde{C}-\frac{2(\ell+1) \tilde{C}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{C}_{S} .
\end{array}
$$

In the case where $f_{i j} h^{i j}=h$ is given $\left(h^{r r}=h-\tau\right)$ :
(1) compute $A_{S}$ and $\tilde{B}_{S}$,
(2) solve wave equations for $A$ and $\tilde{B}$ (a wave operator shifted in $\ell$ ),

- solve the system composed of
- definition of $A$
- definition of $\tilde{B}$
- $H^{r}=0$
- $H^{\mu}=0$ (Dirac gauge)
- $H^{\eta}=0$
on the one hand, and
on the other hand,

DEFINE $\ell$ BY $\ell \quad$ WAVE EQUATION $\square h^{i j}=S^{i j}$

$$
\begin{aligned}
\tilde{B}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}+\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2(\ell+1)} \\
\tilde{C}_{\ell m} & =2 B_{\ell m}-\frac{C_{\ell m}}{2 \ell}
\end{aligned}
$$

$$
\begin{array}{r}
\square \tilde{B}+\frac{2 \ell \tilde{B}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{B}_{S}, \\
\square \tilde{C}-\frac{2(\ell+1) \tilde{C}}{r^{2}}=\tilde{C}_{S} .
\end{array}
$$

In the case where $f_{i j} h^{i j}=h$ is given $\left(h^{r r}=h-\tau\right)$ :
(1) compute $A_{S}$ and $\tilde{B}_{S}$,
(2) solve wave equations for $A$ and $\tilde{B}$ (a wave operator shifted in $\ell$ ),
(3) solve the system composed of

- definition of $A$
- definition of $\tilde{B}$
- $H^{r}=0$
- $H^{\mu}=0$ (Dirac gauge)
- $H^{\eta}=0$
on the one hand, and
on the other hand,
(1) recover the tensor components.


## Numbrical Tests

Is THE WAVE EQUATION SOLVED?

## Introduction

Constrained evolution
Evolution Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution


Initial data: Gaussian profile for $h^{r r}$ and $\mu$, with $\ell=2$ and $\ell=3$ modes. Evolution compared to the method of Bonazzola et al. (2004)
$\square h^{i j}=0$, with $\mathcal{D}_{j} h^{i j}=0$ and $\operatorname{det} f^{i j}+h^{i j}=1$ $d t=0.02, R=20$.
4 domains with 33 points in each.

Numerical Tests
Is THE SOLUTION DIVERGENCE-FREE?

Tensor Wave Equation

Introduction
Constrained evolution

Evolution
Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution
Iensor Evolution
Method
Results
Summary


## Introduction

Constrained evolution
Evolution
Equation
Numerical Methods

Vector Evolution
Spherical
Harmonics
PDEs
Time Evolution

- Algorithm to solve the tensor wave equation, ensuring the divergence-free condition,
- For a given value of the trace, solve only for two scalar wave equations,
- Designed for spectral methods in spherical coordinates (gain in CPU).
- Algorithm to solve the tensor wave equation, ensuring the divergence-free condition,
- For a given value of the trace, solve only for two scalar wave equations,
- Designed for spectral methods in spherical coordinates (gain in CPU).
- Test it with the full Einstein equations,
- Take into account the full linear operator (with the "shift advection"),
- Evolution of one black hole,
- Extension to bi-spherical coordinates (Ansorg 2005)...

風 M．Ansorg，Phys．Rev．D 72024018 （2005）．
S．Bonazzola，E．Gourgoulhon，P．Grandclément and J．Novak， Phys．Rev．D 70104007 （2004）．
R P．A．M．Dirac，Phys．Rev．114， 924 （1959）．
J．Mathews，J．Soc．Indust．Appl．Math．10， 768 （1962）．
國 K．Thorne，Rev．Mod．Physics 52， 299 （1980）．
囯 F．J．Zerilli，J．Math．Physics 11， 2203 （1970）．

$$
\begin{aligned}
\Delta_{\theta \varphi} \eta= & \left(\frac{\partial h^{r \theta}}{\partial \theta}+\frac{h^{r \theta}}{\tan \theta}+\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial h^{r \varphi}}{\partial \varphi}\right) \\
\Delta_{\theta \varphi} \mu= & \left(\frac{\partial h^{r \varphi}}{\partial \theta}+\frac{h^{r \varphi}}{\tan \theta}-\frac{1}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial h^{r \theta}}{\partial \varphi}\right), \\
\Delta_{\theta \varphi}\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) W= & \frac{\partial^{2} P}{\partial \theta^{2}}+\frac{3}{\tan \theta} \frac{\partial P}{\partial \theta}-\frac{1}{\sin ^{2} \theta} \frac{\partial^{2} P}{\partial \varphi^{2}}-2 P \\
& +\frac{2}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial}{\partial \varphi}\left(\frac{\partial h^{\theta \varphi}}{\partial \theta}+\frac{h^{\theta \varphi}}{\tan \theta}\right), \\
\Delta_{\theta \varphi}\left(\Delta_{\theta \varphi}+2\right) X= & \frac{\partial^{2} h^{\theta \varphi}}{\partial \theta^{2}}+\frac{3}{\tan \theta} \frac{\partial h^{\theta \varphi}}{\partial \theta}-\frac{1}{\sin ^{2} \theta} \frac{\partial^{2} h^{\theta \varphi}}{\partial \varphi^{2}}-2 h^{\theta \varphi} \\
& -\frac{2}{\sin \theta} \frac{\partial}{\partial \varphi}\left(\frac{\partial P}{\partial \theta}+\frac{P}{\tan \theta}\right) .
\end{aligned}
$$

